



MEMORANDUM

TO: Architectural Review Committee

FROM: Andrew Perez, Planning Manager

SUBJECT: Reconsideration of Staff Project 23-005; East Branch Street Tile and Concrete Replacement; Location – East Branch Street Between Traffic Way and Crown Hill Street; Applicant – City of Arroyo Grande

DATE: May 1, 2023

SUMMARY OF ACTION:

Direction from the Architectural Review Committee will result in a recommendation for City Council to approve design choices for the sidewalk and tree well tile replacement and crosswalk replacement.

IMPACT ON FINANCIAL AND PERSONNEL RESOURCES:

The design and implementation of the streetscape project will be decided by the City Council with recommendation from the Architectural Review Committee. Impacts to personnel resources are consult and design management.

RECOMMENDATION:

Review the alternatives presented and make a recommendation to the City Council.

BACKGROUND:

Sidewalks and tree wells in the Village are currently lined with terracotta tiles. These tiles have cracked and fractured in many locations throughout the Village requiring extensive maintenance and frequent repairs (Attachment 1). Additionally, these bands present slipping hazards when wet and are difficult to replace in-like due to color differentiations, resulting in an overall inconsistent streetscape. Some crosswalks in the Village are made of colored asphalt and are worn out and in disrepair.

This Project is part of the City's Annual Concrete Repairs project where the City repairs sidewalk segments that are damaged or displaced in priority areas such as the Village, routes to schools and heavy pedestrian areas, and also includes infill of sidewalk gaps. This Project will replace the tiles in the sidewalk and tree wells and replace the colored asphalt crosswalks. Eikhoff Design Group has been hired to design the Project. The first

Architectural Review Committee

Reconsideration of Staff Project 23-005; East Branch Street Tile and Concrete Replacement; Location – East Branch Street Between Traffic Way and Crown Hill Street; Applicant – City of Arroyo Grande

May 1, 2023

Page 2

step is to select what treatments will be used. The two alternatives presented for consideration are stamped concrete and pavers.

Previous Reviews

On March 20, 2023 the Architectural Review Committee was presented the materials and colors identified by the City's consultant as options for the sidewalk and tree well tile replacement (Attachment 2). After the initial review, the Committee came to the conclusion that the integral colored stamped concrete was appropriate for the heavily trafficked areas, such as crosswalks and sidewalk bands. Pavers were chosen as the preferred material for the tree wells taking future maintenance and drainage into consideration. The Committee also stated a preference for the basketweave pattern and the Brick Red 160 color.

At the last meeting on April 24, 2023, staff reported to the Architectural Review Committee that the unit cost for stamped concrete and pavers is approximately equal based on information gathered from completed projects in Pismo Beach, Grover Beach and San Luis Obispo and having discussed installation methods and costs with Air Vol Block (Attachment 3). With that information, the ARC recommended the use of a uniform concrete brick paver in a red brick color for the sidewalk bands, planters, and crosswalks. The recommendation included the use of a basket weave pattern for the bands and planters, and a 90-degree herringbone pattern for the crosswalks.

It is recommended that we bid the Project with additive alternates. This way we can get a price for pavers and stamped concrete in the Village. Staff is requesting that the ARC reconsider the recommendation under the assumption that the pricing for each option is roughly equal.

ANALYSIS OF ISSUES:

The project involves the replacement of the tiled areas of the streetscape and the colored asphalt crosswalks throughout the Village along Branch Street between Traffic Way and Crown Hill Street. The section of Bridge Street from West Branch Street to Nelson Street as well as a small section of Mason Street have also been identified for this project. The primary distinctions between the two alternatives are overall aesthetic qualities. Both stamped concrete and brick pavers offer a remedy to the frequent maintenance issues associated with the current terracotta tiles and should provide a net cost savings to the City, as well as reducing liability concerns and potential trip hazards. The tile bands will be expanded by 50% in square footage (from 12 to 18 inches in width) regardless of material or pattern choice. There are 51 tree wells, 1,242 square feet of tile bands (approximately 110 bands), and 2,126 square feet of crosswalks identified in the project area.

Architectural Review Committee

Reconsideration of Staff Project 23-005; East Branch Street Tile and Concrete Replacement; Location – East Branch Street Between Traffic Way and Crown Hill Street; Applicant – City of Arroyo Grande

May 1, 2023

Page 3

Design Guidelines

The Village Design Guidelines (“the Guidelines”) state that street furniture shall be compatible and consistent with City approved street furniture. Due to the location in the Village, material changes to these areas require a recommendation from the Architectural Review Committee (Attachment 4). Additionally, the Guidelines require exposed aggregate sidewalks with brick, stone or tile bands along Branch Street from Traffic Way to Tally Ho Creek and on Bridge Street between Branch Street and Nelson Street, in the Downtown district. Other streets within the Village Core Downtown and Mixed-Use districts may have exposed aggregate sidewalks or conventional concrete, as approved by the City. The Guidelines state that an objective of the Village Core Downtown area is to enhance and maintain a compact, active street frontage with commercial uses that attract pedestrians. Visual continuity should be maintained through site design and compatibility of scale and materials. Regarding the streetscape, the Guidelines state that landscaping shall retain existing trees and plants as much as possible. Street trees and sidewalk planters shall be incorporated where feasible and pedestrian circulation will not be obstructed. The project does not propose to remove any existing street trees or vegetation, and therefore, is consistent with this standard.

Material and Color

As previously stated, stamped concrete and paver are options for replacing existing tile bands and tree well bands. Based on the two previous reviews, pavers are the preferred option by the ARC. Staff is now asking that the ARC to review and consider both a clay paver and concrete paver. The clay paver is a sand set paver that is rated to withstand heavy vehicle travel. The paver has a beveled edge and meets ADA standards for surface texture and design. A concrete paver provides the same benefits with regards to durability and compliance with ADA standards. The concrete pavers being considered are made to order by Air-Vol Block and the color can be customized to a certain degree. Clay bricks are manufactured by another company and available in limited colors. Staff will provide color samples at the meeting for the clay brick.

ALTERNATIVES:

1. Review the proposed alternatives and make a recommendation for Alternative 1 to the City Council
2. Provide other direction to staff.

ADVANTAGES:

Selection of either alternative will result in overall aesthetic improvements, reduced maintenance costs, and less slipping and tripping hazards in the project area.

DISADVANTAGES:

None.

Architectural Review Committee

Reconsideration of Staff Project 23-005; East Branch Street Tile and Concrete Replacement; Location – East Branch Street Between Traffic Way and Crown Hill Street; Applicant – City of Arroyo Grande

May 1, 2023

Page 4

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the State CEQA Guidelines, and the Arroyo Grande Procedures for the Implementation of CEQA, the project has been determined to be categorically exempt per Section 15031(c) of the CEQA Guidelines regarding projects within existing highways and streets, sidewalks, gutters, bicycle and pedestrian trails and similar features.

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION AND COMMENTS:

The Agenda was posted at City Hall and on the City's website in accordance with Government Code Section 54954.2

Attachments:

1. Existing Conditions
2. Minutes of the March 20, 2023 ARC Meeting
3. Draft Minutes of the April 24, 2023 Special Meeting
4. Design Guidelines